

Medical education challenges: attracting the “Generation Y” workforce

Professor Jennifer Cleland

John Simpson Chair of Medical Education
Research, University of Aberdeen

Chair of the Association for the Study of
Medical Education (ASME)



Background

- There are many known influences on medical careers decision making e.g.,
 - Gender ¹
 - Individual preferences/”fit” ²
 - Exposure/experience of a specialty or a locality ³
 - Wish for work/life balance ⁴
 - Medical School ^{5, 6}

1. van der Horst et al. Med Educ 2010;44:595–602
2. Soethout et al. Med Teach 2008;30:15–30
3. Nichols et al. Rur Remote Health2004; 4:259.
4. Dorsey et al. Acad Med 2005;80:791–6
5. Parkhouse & Palmer. Br Med J 1977 Jul 2; 2(6078): 25–27.
6. Cleland, Johnston et al. BMC Medical Education 2014, 14:151.



...le of 1 to 5 where 1 represents
you rate your level of satisfaction

1 2 3 4 5

... where 1 represents
... level of





Our approach

- A discrete choice experiment (DCE)
 - Health economics - when faced with different choices, people put value on particular (stable) preferences
 - By asking people to state their preferences from hypothetical alternatives, the relative value, or strength, of different factors can be identified
 - This can be quantifiable in monetary terms “willingness-to-pay”, which allows the strength of preferences to be calculated and compared
-

You are coming to the end of your current post and you are looking for your next job. The Ministry of Health has sent you a summary of your next post, but you have also seen an advertisement for a job in the newspaper.

You compare the two job descriptions:

Generic (unlabelled) design

<i>Attribute</i>	JOB A	JOB B
MONTHLY SALARY	BASIC	20% INCREASE
LOCATION	URBAN	RURAL
WORKLOAD	HIGH	LOW
HOUSING	PROVIDED	NOT PROVIDED
FURTHER TRAINING	AFTER 5 YEARS	AFTER 2 YEARS

Which job would you take? Job A Job B

▶ Take neither

Opt-out option

Levels of attribute

Populating the DCEs

- Literature review
- Online qualitative survey (students and trainees)
 - What three things are most/least important to you when making a decision re your medical career
- FY2 focus group discussions
- Draft DCEs piloted with target populations



Trainee (resident) /student DCE

Characteristics/Attributes	Description given to respondents	Possible levels
Familiarity with hospital/unit	This refers to how familiar you are with the hospital or unit, whether you have rotated around it previously or have other knowledge of it	Unfamiliar Quite familiar Very familiar
Geographical location	This refers the geographical location of the training position including the amenities on offer and the proximity to your family/friends	Desirable Not so desirable
Opportunities for partner/spouse	How much does the location offer employment/training opportunities for your partner/spouse (if you have one)	Limited opportunities Good opportunities
Potential earnings	This refers to how your potential earnings compare against average career earnings in your chosen specialty after completing training	Average earnings 5% above average 10% above average 20% above average
Clinical/academic reputation	This refers to the prestige/status associated with the Hospital/Unit/Programme	Indifferent reputation Good reputation Excellent reputation
Working conditions	This refers to working conditions, such as rotas, amount of on-call, time off and/or staffing levels etc.	Poor Good Excellent

This section invites you to consider alternative placements/opportunities for your next stage of career. Imagine you are looking for your next position and have been offered two alternatives. The two positions only differ according to the characteristics outlined below. All other unmentioned characteristics are the same.

Please take a moment to read through these characteristics outlined below.

You may **not like either** position but we would like you to state which you think is **better!**

There are a series of 9 choices.

Choice 1 of 9: Which position would you prefer?

	Position "A"	Position "B"
Geographical Location	Not so desirable location	Desirable location
Familiarity with hospital/unit	Unfamiliar	Quite familiar
Opportunities for partner/spouse	Good opportunities	Limited opportunities
Potential earnings	Average earnings	20% above average
Working conditions	Poor conditions	Excellent conditions
Clinical/academic reputation	Indifferent reputation	Good reputation
Please tick one box	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Trainee Valuations



Valuations



+52%



+40%



+32%



Final Year student Valuations



+44%



+31%



Six UK schools

Approx. 10% of the UK's 2014 graduating cohort

Working conditions were the key driver of trainee and final year medical student career decisions

These were significantly more valued than are desirable geographical locations, unit reputation, familiarity with the unit or opportunities for partner/spouse





What about FY2s?

- We designed another DCE specifically for FY2s
- Completed in June 2016, by 700/800 Scottish FY2s

Characteristics/Priority areas	Description given to respondents	Possible levels
Geographical Locality	This refers to the geographical location of the training position including amenities on offer, and the proximity to your family and friends, and/or spouse/partner employment opportunities.	Desirable Location Undesirable Location
Familiarity With Specialty	This refers to how familiar you are with the specialty, whether you have rotated around it previously or have knowledge or experience of it.	Unfamiliar. Quite familiar. Very familiar.
Culture of Working and Learning Environment.	This refers to perceiving that you are a valued and respected member of staff whose training and learning needs are supported.	Supportive Culture. Unsupportive Culture.
Potential earnings	This refers to how your potential earnings compare against average career earnings in your chosen specialty after completing training.	Average earnings 5% above average 10% above average 20% above average
Working Conditions	This refers to working conditions, such as rotas and shift patterns, amount of on call, time off and staffing levels.	Excellent Conditions. Good Conditions. Poor Conditions.
Opportunities for Professional Development	This refers to opportunities to undertake academic research, teaching, and training throughout your training programme and career.	Excellent opportunities. Average opportunities. Poor opportunities.

Choice 1 of 13: Which position would you prefer?

	Position "A"	Position "B"
Geographical Location	Undesirable Location	Desirable Location
Familiarity with specialty	Quite Familiar	Unfamiliar
Culture of working and Learning Environment.	Unsupportive Culture	Supportive Culture
Potential Earnings	10% Above Average	20% Above Average
Working Conditions	Excellent Conditions	Poor Conditions
Opportunities for Professional Development	Average Opportunities	Poor Opportunities

What about junior doctors (FY2s)?

- FY2s want a training post that is:
 - located in a **desirable location**
 - offering a **supportive working environment** and **excellent working conditions** that include excellent opportunities to expand their **professional development**
 - Is in a speciality with which they are familiar
 - The most important attribute when moving from one level to another was from a desirable to undesirable location (45.7%)
 - The move from a supportive culture to an unsupportive culture would have to be compensated by 40.02% of annual potential earnings.
-

Thoughts

(drawing on some of our other studies too!)

- Senior students and residents/trainees want a fulfilled and well-balanced life
 - They want supported and trained
 - They want to feel valued and part of the team
 - They struggle to understand service delivery as a means of meeting their training needs
 - They want opportunities for time out of training (e.g., to do a research post or research degree)
-

Thoughts (cont)

- Senior students, FYs and trainees want a fulfilled and well-balanced life
 - They want supported and trained
 - They want to feel valued and part of the team
 - They struggle to understand service delivery as a means of meeting their training needs
 - They want opportunities for time out of training
 - Can't change where a workplace/hospital is located, but can control the internal environment/organisational culture
 - Need to “sell” a post so it is attractive to them, so it ticks **their** boxes
 - Need to involve them, so rotas and opportunities are seen as **fair**
-

Messages for recruitment and retention?

- The current generation have high expectations of jobs, and some studies predict they will switch jobs frequently because of this*
- They want:
 - A good team
 - To feel valued and a sense of belonging
 - Positive feedback
 - CPD opportunities
 - Less than Full-Time working
- Can our healthcare systems and structures provide this?



- Cleland JA and Johnston PG. Enculturation into medicine: power for teachers or empowering learners. *Medical Education* 2012; 46: 835-37.
- Cleland JA, Reeve J, Rosenthal J, Johnston P. Resisting the tick box culture: refocusing medical education and training. *British Journal of General Practice*, 2014; 64: 422-424.
- Cleland JA, Johnston P, Watson V, Krucien N, Skatun D. What do UK doctors-in-training value in a post? A discrete choice experiment. *Medical Education* 2016; 50: 189-202.
- Moore JN, McDiarmid AJ, Johnston PW, Cleland JA. MBChB. Identifying and exploring factors influencing career choice, recruitment and retention of Anaesthesia trainees in the UK. *Postgraduate Medical Journal*, Online First, published on June 15, 2016 as 10.1136/postgradmedj-2015-133518
- Cleland JA, Johnston P, Watson V, Krucien N, Skatun D. What do UK medical students value most in their career? A discrete choice experiment. In press, *Medical Education*.
- Scanlon et al. What do UK Foundation Doctors value most in their career? A discrete choice experiment. In preparation

